RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**AutoSolve, Inc.** **Saint Augustine, FL**	**Baton Global, LLC** **Des Moines, IA**	**Chrysalis Research & Consulting, LLC.** **Atlanta, GA**	**CPS HR Consulting** **Sacramento, CA**
Years in business	30+	12	Did not provide	41 Years
Understanding of Requirements	City needs a defensible, market-informed, fiscally sustainable classification system that is practical for long-term administration. Resolve pay compression & competitive pay plans to attract/retain qualified staff.	Evaluate and update current comp system and existing foundation. Strategic review to ensure long-term sustainability. Evaluate internal equity across departments/bargaining units, analyze spread between steps & grades, identify strategies for hard to fill classifications, address top-step comp challenges, resolve pay compression.	Update/refresh current classification and pay-grade framework, prepare City leadership for upcoming collective bargaining cycles, strengthen City's Total Rewards competitiveness to mitigate turnover / accelerated retirement, address pay compression, develop strategies for hard-to-fill classifications, formulate top-step strategies and retention tools, provide historical & projected COLA/trend analysis, audit for FLSA exempt/non-exempt designations.	Refine & revalidate 2018 study, to account for economic shifts, regional labor market competition, inflationary pressure. Prepare for upcoming collective bargaining cycles, address recruitment & retention.
Brief History/Overview of Organization & Services Provided	Strategic HR firm providing management & HR consulting services (class/comp studies, org assessments, HR business strategy & policy design, business process re-engineering, strategic planning) for 30+ yrs. Have worked w/over 1,000 public & private sector organizations across the U.S., specializing in local government (municipalities, counties, K-12 school districts, higher-ed institutions).	Strategic advisory and research firm w/strategic methodologies and talent models grounded in academic research, data collection and rigorous market intelligence. Specializes in strategy and organizational design, workforce and talent strategy, leadership development, coaching, custom research and data insights.	Providing data-driven research, fiscal policy analysis, quantitative public-sector studies to local governments nationwide. Completed 30+ HUD & State-compliant engagements involving market benchmarking, demographic and economic analysis, equity assessments, paired w/structured stakeholder interviews, steering committees, and public workshops.	Public sector HR organization, works exclusively w/government employers. Class and compensation studies are core service. 2,700+ public & non-profit clients throughout U.S. focusing on consulting services for talent management, HR compliance, testing and selection, organizational culture, learning and development, management consulting, licensing and certification.
Number of Employees within organization	Four (4)	Dozens	Not provided	100+ full time employees, nationwide network of 200+ project consultants/technical experts.
Project team	Project team of 4 identified, including titles, experience, background, and professional summaries.	Project team of 3 identified, including titles, experience, background and professional summaries.	Four (4) core team members highlighted. Background, capabilities, roles provided. Noted have access to associate researchers & subject matter reviewers as needed for data collections, etc. Firm's primary focus is housing/community development will add compensation subconsultant at City's request.	Seven (7) member team (project manager plus 6 consultants/ operations/support team members) identified. Names, backgrounds, roles, years w/team, resumes provided.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**AutoSolve, Inc.** **Saint Augustine, FL**	**Baton Global, LLC** **Des Moines, IA**	**Chrysalis Research & Consulting, LLC.** **Atlanta, GA**	**CPS HR Consulting** **Sacramento, CA**
Proposed Methodology & Approach	• Data Collection & • Job Analysis: Electronic, cloud-based PDQs & anonymous org survey to gather employee input & update job descriptions. • Market Benchmarking: Surveys 10-20 City-approved peer entities in MI, adj for cost of living, cross-reference w/private sector data. Internal • Equity: Applies point-factor job eval methodology to build position hierarchies & analyze spreads btwn grades & steps. "Pay Plan Tool" Delivers customized, executable Excel-based employee pay plan management system feat 7+ implementation cost options. Final Presentation & • Support: Formal presentation to City Council, system training, & 6 months compl post-study support.	• Phase 1: Project initiation - kick off meeting, data collection setup, approval of benchmark peer municipalities. • Phase 2: Market Analysis - conduct market match & job description reviews, COLA/trend analysis, complete total rewards gap analysis against peer entities & third -party data sources. • Phase 3: Internal Equity & Structure Analysis - Evaluate internal equity across departments/bargaining units using existing point-factor eval system, analyzes step/grade spreads, create compression mitigation strategies, review hard-to-fill positions • Phase 4: Final Report & Council Adoption - audit positions for compliance, deliver final report, transfer system maintenance tools & training to HR, formal presentation to City Council.	• Milestone 1: Project Initiation, Data Collection, Peer Selection - Kickoff meeting, job description review, & selection/approval of 10-15 public-sector peers. • Milestone 2: Market Benchmarking & Total Rewards Analysis - Benchmark cross-section of 60-80 core/standard classifications against peers. Remaining roles slotted against existing 13-factor internal equity structure. Deliver Draft Market Analysis & Total Rewards Gap Analysis Report. • Milestone 3: Internal Equity, Structure, Compliance - Reconcile market data against internal job hierarchies, analyze step/grade spreads, develop compression mitigation options, audit for FLSA compliance, deliver internal equity report. • Milestone 4: Final Report, Adoption, Support - prepare comprehensive final report, conduct 2 bargaining-prep workshops w/City leadership/HR, deliver editable spreadsheet-based modeling tools, present to City Council, provide baseline 60-90 days free post-implementation support.	• Total Rewards approach w/4 milestones: Milestone 1. Data Validation & Peer Market Selection of up to 10 entities. Milestone 2. Market Benchmarking up to 80 representative classification & total rewards gap analysis blending base pay, health benefits, leave structure, retirement, COLA & market research. Milestone 3. Internal equity & compliance review, analyze step & grade spreads, resolve pay compression, address top-step & hard to fill roles, complete FLSA audit. Milestone 4. Final report w/updated salary recs, system tools transfer to HR, up to 2 internal working sessions to prepare HR & negotiation teams, in person council presentation.
Project Schedule/Timeline	Est duration 15 working weeks, some milestones run concurrently Study Initiation/Kickoff: 1 week Project Management: 15 weeks Current Pay Plan: 3 weeks Classification Evaluation: 8 weeks Compensation Evaluation & Non-Emergency/Emergency: 8 wks Class framework/comp management, system w/implementation options: 3 weeks Final Report/system training: 3 weeks Complimentary support: 6 months	Est 20 weeks to complete Phase 1 - Project Initiation, data collection, kickoff mtg, selection & approval of benchmark peer municipalities - weeks 1-4 Phase 2 - Market analysis & job description review, COLA/trend analysis, total rewards gap analysis - weeks 5-10 Phase 3 - Internal equity & structure analysis, step/grade spread analysis, compression mitigation strategies, hard to fill classification review - weeks 11-16 Phase 4: Final report & Council adoption, FLSA audit, system maintenance & tools/training transfer - weeks 17-20	Milestone 1: kickoff, data collections setup, peer selections, months 1-2; Milestone 2 - draft market analysis & total rewards gap analysis, months 2-4; Milestone 3 - internal equity, step/grade spread, compression mitigation, month 4-6; Milestone 4 - final report, tools/training transfer, Council presentation, month 7.	Approx 6-month schedule. Phase 1: Wks 1-4 - Project launch, data collection, position reconciliations, selection of up to 80 benchmark positions, selection of 10 comparator peers. Phase 2: Wks 5-12 - external market surveys, base pay benchmarking, COLA/trend analysis, Total Rewards gap analysis, draft report delivery. Phase 3: Wks 13-20 - validation of internal equity ratings, step/grade spread analysis, compression resolution modeling, top-step strategies, hard to fill recommendations, FLSA determinations. Phase 4: Wks 21-26 - Final report consolidation, bargaining prep workshops w/HR/leadership, HR system maintenance tools/training transfer, in person CC presentation.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**AutoSolve, Inc.** **Saint Augustine, FL**	**Baton Global, LLC** **Des Moines, IA**	**Chrysalis Research & Consulting, LLC.** **Atlanta, GA**	**CPS HR Consulting** **Sacramento, CA**
Key Personnel Hourly Rates	Addtnl Authorized Work if needed - $187.50/hourly Additional travel will require travel reimbursement	not provided	Proj Lead & Fiscal Policy: $185/hr Research Analyst: $150/hr Consultant: $125/hr	Project Manager/Principal Consultant - $150/hr Senior HR Consultant - $135/hr Associate HR Consultant/Program Coordinator - $120/hr Estimated hrs by milestone & personnel also provided in proposal. Est hours are provided for reference. Milestone price is fixed regardless of actual hours expended.
References of comparable projects of similar scope & volume within last 5 years	Athens-Clark County, GA; Brunswick County, VA; City of New Prague, MN; Dinwiddie County, VA; Town of Rolesville, NC; City of Rincon, GA; City of Americus, GA	City of Aspen, CO; Des Moines Area Regional Transit Authority (DART), IA; Greater Des Moines Partnership, IA; Santa Cruz Public Libraries, CA; Pledge 1%, CA; Life Care Services, IA; Iowa Workforce Development; Greater Omaha Chamber, NE	Goldsboro, NC; City of Eau Claire, WI; County of San Bernadino, CA; Binghamton NY; Hanford, CA; Logan, UT.	City of Plano, Tx; City of Long Neach, CA; UTE Pass Regional Health Service District, CO; City of Redwood City, CA; Paradise Irrigation District, Paradise, CA; Ranch CA Water; County of Montgomery, MD; City of Princeton, TX
Identify potential project challenges	Pointed out that timelines depend on City providing data promptly, employees submitting PDQs on schedule, & peer organizations responding to market surveys in timely manner.	Sound project management & communication; timely responses from City for on time execution. Mitigation strategies provided.	Coordinating multiple bargaining units on a compressed timeline, Southeast Michigan comparator selection requires careful attention; preserving the 2018 framework while updating for current market conditions, data availability across 11 departments and as-needed personnel, firm experience concentrated in housing & community development rather than compensation studies specifically. Mitigation strategies provided in proposal.	Job description accuracy; availability &d accuracy of background materials; comparator agency responsiveness; job match validation & review cycles; resolving compression within a "refine not replace" mandate; one structure serving multiple bargaining units on staggered cycles; 6-month timeline crossing the year-end period. Mitigation strategies provided.
Total Not-To-Exceed Cost	**$43,500.00**	**$64,500.00**	**$65,000.00**	**$99,000.00**
Exceptions	None	Third Party data is subject to the original licensor's terms. Request that indemnification is limited to claims caused by vendor's own negligence, errors, omissions.	None	Exceptions include: Motor Vehicle Liability, cancellation notice/renewal certificates, indemnification provided.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**Cottingham & Butler Insurance Services, LLC** **Madison, WI**	**Educational Data Systems, Inc.** **Dearborn, MI**	**Elevate Consultings, LLC** **Boston, MA**	**HR Collaborative** **Grand Rapids, MI**
Years in business	139 Years/30 Years in compensation practice	47 Years	7 Years	13 Years
Understanding of Requirements	Collaboratively balance external market pressure w/internal fairness. Address and review total compensation equation (wages & fringe benefits). Validation of internal alignment of 2018 study.	Objective, integrated, practical evaluation of class system, pay structure, employee placement, fringe benefits, & administrative comp policies for upcoming collective bargaining, to strengthen recruitment & retention, & maintain long-term fiscal responsibility. Build upon existing frameworks.	Validate, recalibrate, modernize existing class & comp system. Prepare defensible data for upcoming collective bargaining cycles, restore external market competitiveness eroded by post-2018 macroeconomic shifts, maintain internal equity foundation established by existing framework.	Ensure market competitiveness & internal equity. Build upon/refine existing pay structure. Use market data for collective bargaining prep & establish defensible total rewards structure to address turnover, retirement projections, & market competition.
Brief History/Overview of Organization & Services Provided	Offers HR consulting for employee comp and total rewards, performance evaluation development and training, employee engagement, strength-based leadership, employee relations, and HR audits.	4+ decades providing workforce, classification, compensation, job analysis, organizational consulting services to municipal governments, counties, public authorities, utilities, workforce systems, and state agencies.	Full-service HR consulting firm specializing in public sector compensation, classification, organizational development. Serves municipal government, county agencies, public utilities, higher education institutions, quasi-public organizations across U.S. Core practice areas compensation and class studies, total rewards benchmarking, FLSA compliance auditing, pay equity analysis, job architecture design, collective bargaining prep, and HR policy development.	13 yrs HR consulting experience, now part of Kinexus HR, Inc./Kinexus Group. Services include wage and salary studies, market benchmarking job evaluation, internal equity analysis, pay architecture/leveling, FLSA audits, total rewards strategies, talent acquisition and executive search, org development & strategy, and HR compliance/operations.
Number of Employees within organization	1,400+ employees nationwide	850 employees nationwide	Not provided	Fifteen (15)
Project team	Three (3) staff members assigned to project. Background, capabilities, years w/company provided. Resumes provided.	Three (3) team members identified in addition to CEO (project manager/primary lead analyst, executive oversight/quality assurance, and workforce consultant). Names, backgrounds, roles, yrs w/company, bios provided.	Four (4) team members identified (lead consultant/project lead, lead compensation analyst, research & data analyst, project administration & scheduling). Name of Project Lead given, other roles are subcontracted. Background, experience, given for all proposed roles except for project coordinator. No info given on project coordinator.	Three (3) project team members identified: Director of Client Success, & 2 HR Consultants. Names, titles, roles, previous experience, resumes provided.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**Cottingham & Butler Insurance Services, LLC** **Madison, WI**	**Educational Data Systems, Inc.** **Dearborn, MI**	**Elevate Consultings, LLC** **Boston, MA**	**HR Collaborative** **Grand Rapids, MI**
Proposed Methodology & Approach	1. Initial Alignment & Target Market Setup - kickoff w/HR/leadership, employee census data collection, collaborative selection of 10 to 20 public-sector peer entities & private sector survey sources. 2. Job evals & FLSA Audit - review job documentation & validate position hierarchy using point-factor job evaluation system, provide half-day job evaluation training session to City staff. 3. Market Benchmarking & Dept Head Interviews - measures benchmark positions against external market datasets & conducts structured interviews w/dept heads. 4. Pay Philosophy Exploration & Structure Design - present preliminary market results & guide City leadership through decision points regarding market positioning, pay range spreads, wage compression mitigation, employee-level cost modeling. 5. Final recommendations & system hand-off - present final salary structures, implementation plans, employee communications tools for formal adoption, transfer system maintenance files to HR.	• Five primary principals: preserve & strengthen existing foundations, evaluate based on actual role content, dual base salary & total rewards view, balance external competitiveness w/internal equity, create maintainable system. • Task 1: Project initiation, data collection, study framework. • Task 2: Classification, job description, internal equity review. • Task 3: Market compensation & total rewards analysis. • Task 4: Pay structure, compression, policy analysis. • Task 5: Recommendations, cost modeling, implementation planning. • Task 6: Final reporting, training, Council presentation, post support.	• Phase 1 - Foundation & Data • Collection: stakeholder kickoff, job description review, peer jurisdiction selection, data collection, 13-factor audit workplan Phase 2 - Market Analysis & Total Rewards • Gap Analysis: Market benchmarking, total rewards gap analysis, COLA & Trend Analysis, Hard to Fill Diagnosis. Phase 3 - Internal Equity, Step/Grade Analysis, • Compression: 13-factor score recalibration, step & grade structure analysis, compression mapping, FLSA audit, top-step strategy. Phase 4 - Final Report, Presentation, • Implementation: cost modeling, bargaining preparation workshops, in-person City Council presentation, toolkit & knowledge transfer, post-implementation support.	Kickoff meeting to confirm expectations & timelines, then review existing documentation & conducting meetings w/ department directors to identify concerns, validate position responsibilities, etc. through interviews/questionnaires/ discussions, & recommends job description revisions as necessary. Positions evaluated using consistent, factor-based methodology to determine value & across specific compensable factors. Internal equity, pay compression, FLSA exempt/non-exempt designations reviewed. Comparative market data gathered from peer municipalities & City's benefit broker. Total rewards evaluated & gap analysis conducted. Overall salary administration & compensation is evaluated. Updated salary ranges, step/grade, top step strategies, future eval procedures are developed.
Project Schedule/Timeline	Project duration 6 months. Month 1 - project orientation & target market setup. Month 2 - job evals & FLSA audit. Month 3 - market pricing & department head interviews. Month 4 & 5 - Preliminary results & pay philosophy exploration. Month 6 - Final recommendations & system hand off. Post adoption- employee appeals process - optional 30 days appeals window for positions w/substantial scope changes.	Approx 6 month schedule Weeks 1-4 - Task 1 - Project Initiation, data collection, study framework Weeks 3-11 - Task 2 - Classification, job description, internal equity review Weeks 5-15 - Task 3 - Market compensation & total rewards analysis Weeks 10-18 - Task 4 - pay structure, compression, compensation policy analysis Weeks 16-22 - Task 5 - Recommendations, cost modeling, implementation planning Weeks 21-26 - Task 6 - final reporting, training, Council presentation, post-implementation support	Approx 7 months/28 weeks Phase 1/wks1-6/Milestone 1: kickoff, job description review, peer jurisdiction selection, PAQ deployment, & 13 factor score matrix audit. Phase 2/wks 5-14/Milestone 2: peer data collection, market benchmarking, component by component total rewards gap analysis, COLA trend analysis, & draft market report. Phase 3/wks 12-22/Milestone 3: 13-factor framework validation/recalibration, step/grade analysis, compression mapping, FLSA compliance audit, top-step strategies. Phase 4/wks 20-28/Milestone 4: Final report, financial cost modeling (3+ adoption scenarios), 2 bargaining prep workshops, in-person City Council presentation, toolkit/training transfer, 60-90 dys post implementation support.	Approx 8 months Part 1 (months 1 -2): Project initiation, job analysis & data collection Part 2 & 3 (months 3-4): Job evaluations, market analysis, total rewards evaluation Part 4 (months 5-6): compensation structure review & recommendations & (months 7-8): final report, Council presentation, project closeout Post-implementation support is not included and the City schedules & pays separately for these services as needed.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**Cottingham & Butler Insurance Services, LLC** **Madison, WI**	**Educational Data Systems, Inc.** **Dearborn, MI**	**Elevate Consultings, LLC** **Boston, MA**	**HR Collaborative** **Grand Rapids, MI**
Key Personnel Hourly Rates	Addtl work/hourly rate: $275/hr, or addtl project fee mutually agreed upon. Addtl on-site meetings billed at hrly rate of $125 during travel & $250/hr while on site, plus travel expenses. Proposal based on 170 unique roles & may change during project, City invoiced $450 for each role beyond 170.	Project manager/primary lead analyst - $165/hr Executive oversight & quality assurance - $225/hr workforce consultant - $125/hr.	Lead Consultant - $200/hr Lead Compensation Analyst - $175/hr Research & Data Analyst - $140/hr Project Coordinator - $100/hr Continued advisory services past 90 day post-implementation window billed at $175/hr, 15 min increments.	Variable Cost - post-implementation support & consulting: $300/hr
References of comparable projects of similar scope & volume within last 5 years	City of Neenah, Wi; City of Oshkosh, WI; Walworth County, WI; City of Wauwatosa, WI; City of Jefferson, WI; City of Green Bay, WI; City of Clinton, IA; City of Urbandale, IA	City of Charlotte, NC/CATS; Des Moines Area Regional Transit (DART), IA; Traverse City Light & Power, MI; Montgomery County, PA; NJ TRANSIT; SMART Transit, Detroit, MI; Detroit Transportation Corporation, MI; Omnitrans, CA; Arizona First Things First	Norwich Public Utilities, CT; David 7 Associates; Mass Energy, MA; The Griffin Collective/Community College Comp Study, MI; Urban Edge/Regional Council of Governments, NC; Whitman Housing Authority, MA; Milton Academy, MA; MassHire Workforce Boards, MA	City of Royal Oak; City of Grand Rapids; City of Big Rapids; Burr Oak Tool Inc, Sturgis, MI; Econ Club, Grand Rapids, MI; HPS, Grand Rapids, MI; Newaygo County, White Cloud, MI; Human Element, Ann Arbor, MI
Identify potential project challenges	Diverse Departments & wide variability in work performed; wage compressions & internal equity concerns; fiscal constraints & implementation feasibility. Challenge approach & past experience to potential challenges provided in proposal.	Confirming the scope for different employee groups; reconciling employee class & comp records; validating job content w/out burdening employees & depts; finding reliable market comparisons for uncommon or hybrid roles; comparing materially different total rewards programs; balancing market results w/internal equity & compression; distinguishing analytical findings from policy/legal decisions; managing expectations concerning individual pay outcomes; maintaining progress through City review points. Mitigation strategies have been provided.	Multi union complexity; peer data collection; framework preservation; implementation risk; stakeholder alignment. Mitigation strategies provided in proposal.	Incomplete or inconsistent position information; limited employee participation or communication gaps; delays in project timeline or availability of key stakeholders. Mitigation strategies have been provided.
Total Not-To-Exceed Cost	**$76,500.00**	**$171,870.00**	**$85,000.00**	**$145,948.48**
Exceptions	None	None	None	None

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**Evergreen Solutions, LLC** **Tallahassee, FL**	**Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.** **Bloomfield Hills, MI**	**HR Data Labs, LLC** **Chester, NY**	**Management Advisory Group International** **Fairfax, VA**
Years in business	7 Years	99 Years	Less than 1 Year	28 Years
Understanding of Requirements	Establish data-driven baseline for upcoming collective bargaining cycles, address turnover, hard to fill positions, projected retirements, & balance external market competitiveness w/internal equity w/out creating unsustainable financial/admin burden. Refine & build upon existing framework to update classifications, fix pay compression, align compensation w/market benchmarks.	Evaluate, refine, improve existing compensation & classification structure, deliver data driven analysis for upcoming bargaining cycles, evaluate total rewards to address recruitment & retention. Rely on existing job descriptions/records, leadership interviews rather than PDQs.	Build on job evaluation methodology implemented in 2018 study to prepare for upcoming bargaining cycles, establish modern defensible total rewards structure to strengthen recruitment & retention.	Evaluate & strengthen existing classification, compensation, total rewards system already in place through validating, refining & improving 13 factor eval framework & pay structure, provide data driven recommendations to strengthen retention & recruitment, prepare for upcoming bargaining cycles w/data & multi-scenario cost projections, & internal equity & market alignment.
Brief History/Overview of Organization & Services Provided	22 years as national, multidisciplinary management consulting firm specializing in public sector. 1,600+ similar studies for local governments and other public sector organizations across the country. Firm is made up of management, HR professionals, & strategic partners.	Found in 1927 and have expanded globally across 33 countries. Specialty in public-sector, community and education consulting for 40+ years, completing 1,500+ class and compensation studies nationally. Services include designing base salary structures, pay architecture, market benchmarking, custom salary surveys, total rewards evaluations, pay equity reviews, executive compensation, HR and organizational effectiveness, compliance and governance, executive/ leadership search, workforce analytics, and change management.	Founded in 2025 as compensation and total rewards advisory firm to public and private sector employers. Consultants avg 25+ yrs exp in total rewards, classification, HRIS/HCM technology, public-sector HR, classification and compensation engagements for municipal & county clients. Services include compensation philosophy and structure design, market pricing, class and grade architecture, pay equity, compression analysis, total rewards strategy, and HR analytics.	28 years experience. Specialize exclusively in class and compensation consulting for government organizations. Have completed hundreds of class and compensation engagements across all 50 states. Serve municipalities, counties, school districts, public utilities, public safety agencies. Services inclide classification and job analysis, compensation and market studies, total rewards analysis, pay structure and compression mitigation, implementation and systems support.
Number of Employees within organization	Nineteen (19) full time and six (6) part time employees across five consultant teams	71,000 employees worldwide	Eleven (11) senior level consulting staff	Ten (10) public-sector consultants
Project team	Five (5) team members: project principal, project director, and three (3) project consultants. Names, roles, experience, and resume summaries provided.	Nine (9) project team members identified w/names, titles, roles, experience/background, & prof summaries. Sixteen (16) additional project staff support members identified by name, title, and yrs of experience only.	Team of six (6) proposed: two (2) project leadership and executive oversight, and four (4) technical leads/senior consultants. Names, titles, roles, relevant experience provided.	Team consists of seven (7) members. Names, titles, roles, experience, resumes provided.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**Evergreen Solutions, LLC** **Tallahassee, FL**	**Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.** **Bloomfield Hills, MI**	**HR Data Labs, LLC** **Chester, NY**	**Management Advisory Group International** **Fairfax, VA**
Proposed Methodology & Approach	• Utilize face-to-face meeting/focus groups while leveraging web-based platforms for data collection & analysis (proprietary electronic questionnaires JAT & MIT) to ensure direct employee/managerial input into position evaluations. Access to JobForce Manager proprietary software tool to facilitate ongoing internal maintenance after project closeout. 11 task Methodology: 1 Project initiation to establish communication w/City, finalize schedule & collection protocols. 2 Evaluate current system, review current pay plans, salary schedule, policies, org charts, focus groups w/leadership & employees. 3 Collect & review current data, administer proprietary JAT to employees to gather duties information, administer MIT to supervisors and directors to capture concerns. 4 evaluate & build classification plan & FLSA determinations. 5 Identify list of market survey benchmarks & approved peer public sectors orgs. 6 Conduct market salary/benefits survey w/peer orgs. 7 Analyze gap areas & recommend modifications. 8 Solution Analysis, multi-year financial scenarios, model various salary structures. 9 develop & submit draft & final reports to HR, Council. 10 Prepare manual outline recommendations, training for HR, give access to JobForce Manager software. 11 Provide revised class descriptions.	• Collaborative approach to public sector projects using the acronym C.A.R.E.S: collaborate/consult, advise/assess, recommend/resource, engage/endorse, strategize/serve. Evaluate, refine, improve City's existing framework, emphasizing virtual-first model to maximize budget. • Key project phases: • Phase 1: Initiation & Diagnostic - executive strategy sessions, governance setup, current-state policy/job diagnostic, stakeholder communication plans. • Phase 2: Classification Review - position evals using 15-point documentation checklist, direct manager interviews, FLSA compliance audit. • Phase 3: Compensation & Market Analysis - benchmark 60-65% of roles using published survey databases & custom peer surveys, evaluate total rewards, assess internal equity/compression. • Phase 4: Implementation & Final Deliverables - develop 2-3 salary structure options, placement cost modeling, compression/top step strategies, HR maintenance tools, final report, City Council presentation.• Phase 5: Post-project support - 10 hours of direct technical & advisory support for 6 mo after project completion.	Methodology built on practitioner-led compensation & classifications expertise, not templated survey output. Distribute electronic PDQ to validate essential duties, supervisory relationships, & FLSA tasks. Conduct 1 on 1 small group interview for complex or hard to fill classifications. Distribute custom market survey to peer organization to capture base pay, COLA history, & benefit components. Use standardized templates to collect data for auditable trial.	Treat classification, market benchmarking, benefit valuation, internal equity, salary administration as interconnected system rather than isolated parts. Validate, refine, improve City's existing job evaluation frameworks, retain effective existing elements, minimal operational disruption (rely on existing data & HR coordination rather than organization wide questionnaire or focus groups). Utilize proprietary custom software built for public sector compensation studies to assist w/analyzing data.
Project Schedule/Timeline	Est duration 5 months Task 1 - Project Initiation (month 1) Task 2 - Evaluate Current System (month 1) Task 3 - Collect/review environmental data (months 1-2) Task 4 - Build projected classification plan & FLSA (mths 2-3) Task 5 - Identify market survey benchmarks/targets (mths 2-3) Task 6 - Conduct market salary/benefits survey (mths 3-4) Task 7 - Strategic positioning recommendations (mths 3-4) Task 8 - Solution analysis (months 4-5) Task 9 - Draft & final Reports (months 4-5) Task 10 - Compensation administration recs (months 4-5) Task 11 - Revised class descriptions.	Est duration; 6 months Phase 1 (months 1-2): strategic alignment, project initiation, study administration Phase 2 (months 1-3): Classification Review Phase 3 (months 2-5): Compensation, Benchmarking, Market Analysis Phase 4 (months 4-6): Implementation Strategy, Final Reports, Sustainability Planning Phase 5 (post project): up to 10 hours of direct post-project support for 6 months following project closure	Approx 6 months Milestone 1 (month 1): Contract execution & kickoff, stakeholder alignment, data requests, employee census validation, peer selection. Milestone 2 (months 2-3): job content market matching, COLA/trend analysis, total rewards gap analysis, hard to fill strategies, draft report delivery. Milestone 3 (months 3-4): internal equity evaluation, step/grade spread analysis, top-step strategies, FLSA audit, compression mitigation. Milestone 4 (month 5): final comprehensive report, system maintenance tools/HR training, formal presentation to Council. Month 6 through 8: Post-implementation, as-needed technical support, classification troubleshooting, advisory support.	Est duration 28 weeks / 7 months / 5 phases Phase 1 weeks 1-4: Project initiation & planning (kickoff, work plan, communication protocols, data framework) Phase 2 Weeks 5-8: classification & compensation assessment (class documentation, internal equity, preliminary findings) Phase 3 Weeks 9-16: Market analysis, total rewards & internal equity review (salary survey, benefits assessment, compression, FLSA review) Phase 4 Weeks 17-22: Compensation plan development & implementation strategies (salary structure, cost modeling, implementation options Phase 5 Weeks 23-28: Final Reporting, implementation, knowledge transfer (final report, Council presentation, administrative guidance, editable deliverables.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**Evergreen Solutions, LLC** **Tallahassee, FL**	**Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.** **Bloomfield Hills, MI**	**HR Data Labs, LLC** **Chester, NY**	**Management Advisory Group International** **Fairfax, VA**
Key Personnel Hourly Rates	Blended rate: $200/hr Implementation support to assist w/rollout: $250/hr	Associate Consultant - $250/hr; Consultant - $375/hr; Senior Consultant - $455/hr; Principal - $495/hr; Managing Director - $575/hr *Opt Ongoing Services: Pay Equity Review & Dashboard - $7,500; Ongoing Ad-Hoc Rev - $13,500/annum up to 25 requests; Ann Trend Memo - $3,500/ annum; Mrkt Bnchmrkng Tool (Gallagher CompSight) - $45,000/ annum	Blended hourly rate: $160/hr across all assigned senior personnel	$200/professional hour $60/clerical hour
References of comparable projects of similar scope & volume within last 5 years	Genessee County, MI; Kalamazoo Community College, MI; Glen Oaks Community College, MI; McLean County, IL; City of Dardenne Prairie, MO; City of Winchester, KY; City of Cleveland, TN	City of Ann Arbor, MI; City of Maryville, MO; City of Auston, TX; City of Maricopa, AZ; City of Elyria, OH; City of Ruston, LA; City of Gillette, WY; Prince William County, VA	City of Alcoa, TN; Florida Municipal Power Agency, FL; Town of Essex, VT; County of Hancock, ME; Maine County Commissioners Association, ME; New Smyrna Beach Utilities, FL; Memphis-Shelby County Schools, TN	Bloomfield Twp, MI; Canton Twp, MI; City of Dearborn, MI; City of Southfield, MI; City of Baton Rouge, LA; Webb County, TX; Tork County, SC; City of Coral Springs, FL
Identify potential project challenges	Communication between lines of authority; lack of participation from employees completing the Job Assessment Tool; delays from supervisors in reviewing JATs; inaccurate data provided by employees; email spam filter issues; low response rate from peers w/regard to market salary/benefits survey; lack of buy-in to the process from employees, budget constraints.	Employee Involvement; Leadership Sponsorship; Data/Exceptions; Project Timing; Communication. Mitigation strategies provided.	Coordinating data collection across four employee groups; aligning the study timeline w/upcoming bargaining cycles; reconciling legacy & current benefit tiers in the total rewards gap analysis; limited external market data for certain specialized classifications; change management & employee communication. Mitigation strategies provided.	Balancing market competitiveness w/internal equity; preserving an effective existing system; fiscal responsibility; implementation. Mitigation strategies provided.
Total Not-To-Exceed Cost	**$41,500.00**	**$50,540.00** ***on-site meetings extra cost** ***updated/written job descriptions $550/description**	**$80,000.00**	**$74,000.00**
Exceptions	None	Exceptions to Federal Contracting, Ins Requirements, Ownership of Documents, Personnel Substitutions, Hold Harmless/Indemnification/Liability Cap	No exceptions. Clarification regarding Umbrella Liability Insurance is provided.	None

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**MGT Impact Solutions** **Tampa, FL**	**Rehmann Robson** **Troy, MI**
Years in business	50 Years	85 Years
Understanding of Requirements	Assess market competitiveness, evaluate internal equity, salary compression, grade/step relationships, top step retention challenges, measure comparative value total rewards package, validate FLSA designations, job architecture, & continued effectiveness of existing eval methodology, develop practical & financially resp implem options, equip HR w/tools, training, & protocols needed to maintain system consistently after study is complete.	Objective, comprehensive, legally defensible total rewards framework to attract & retain talent, balance internal equity & external market, ensure fiscal stewardship, provide long-term administration tools.
Brief History/Overview of Organization & Services Provided	50 years experience supporting public sector organizations, educational institutions, non-profits, and critical infrastructure clients. Have completed 30,000+ projects since inception. Services include strategy and implementation, performance & operations, IT infrastructure, cybersecurity, class and compensation studies, total rewards valuation, HR audits and policy review, staffing assessments, performance management and implementation, and collective bargaining support.	Have grown from local accounting firm to comprehensive business, technology, HR, and municipal consulting firm. Specialized public sector workgroup of 130+ professionals that serve approx 1K governmental, municipal, educational, & non-profit entities. Core services include compensation and class studies, executive recruiting, benefit evaluation, FLSA audits, labor relations, HR infrastructure design, accounting and assurance, audit and financial reporting, budget analysis, internal control reviews, IT, cybersecurity, pension/retirement plan services, & corporate risk advisory.
Number of Employees within organization	1,200 professionals nationwide	1,100 associates across 23 regional offices.
Project team	Project team includes Project Director, Project Manager/Primary City Contact, and consultant team of two (2). One (1) of which is a subcontractor. Names, roles, background, experience, & resumes for all including subcontractor provided.	Seven (7) project team members identified (Principal, Senior Manager, two (2) Managers, Senior Analyst, Consultant, Senior Human Resource Business Partner). Backgrounds, roles, years w/company, titles, resumes provided.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**MGT Impact Solutions** **Tampa, FL**	**Rehmann Robson** **Troy, MI**
Proposed Methodology & Approach	Decision making process rather than just salary survey based on disciplined project management, balanced market data, & ensuring equity & sustainability. Philosophy incl preserving what works, evaluating jobs not incumbents, using multiple sources of evidence, separating findings from policy choices, & leave the City w/maintainable system. Structured, collaborative process incl project initiation w/system review, job & market analysis, total rewards analysis, classification & comp plan, implementation planning, & reporting, training & support.	Meet to establish priorities, finalize benchmark positions, confirm peer communities, review key operational needs (bargaining timelines & recruitment challenges). Gather peer wage & benefit data independently through FOIA requests & public records to ensure verified data, & eliminate burden on peer municipalities. Benchmark positions matched based on job description reviews, org reporting, actual responsibilities, rather than job titles. Evaluate base pay along w/complete benefit package. Analyze step/grade structures, FLSA compliance, pay equity, salary compression, hard to fill roles, financial impacts. Conduct regular review meetings to present preliminary findings, test assumptions, refine recommendations, build stakeholder confidence prior to final report delivery.
Project Schedule/Timeline	Est duration 24-32 weeks / 6-8 mths Task 1 Mths 1-2: Study initiation, stakeholder communication, scope confirmation; Task 2 Mths 2-3: Job data collection & analysis (HR managed clarification, no employee JAQs); Task 3 Mths 2-3: Comp target philosophy & current system validation (13 factor McGrath review); Task 4 Mths 3-5: Market data collection & analysis; Task 5 Mths 4-5: Total Rewards Comparison & Gap Analysis Task 6 Mths 5-6: Proposed classification & comp plan (step/grade spread, compression, FLSA, top-step, hard to fill); Task 7 Mth 6-7: Draft recommendations & implementation cost modeling; Task 8 Mths 7-8: Final Report, admin review, 2 virtual bargaining prep workshops, in-person Council presentation, knowledge transfer; Task 9 Mths 8-9+: 60-90 days post study support	36 weeks / 9 months Milestone 1 - wks 1-2 / Aug 2026: Contract Execution, kickoff meeting, selection of 10 primary peer communities (plus 5 alternates) Milestone 2 - wks 3-31 / Sep 2026-Mar 2027: FOIA Data Collection (2-3 months), initial/secondary/third wage & benefit data analysis, draft market report, total rewards gap analysis Milestone 3 - wks 32-33 / Mar-Apr 2027: Internal equity evaluation, step/grade spread analysis, compression mitigation, FLSA review Milestone 4 - wks 34-36 / Apr 2027: Final report delivery, individual total rewards reports setup, formal presentation to City Council Post Implementation - wks 37+ / May-July 2027: 90 day implementation support.

RFP-RH-26-038
Proposal Summary
Compensation Study

Vendor Name **City/State/Zip**	**MGT Impact Solutions** **Tampa, FL**	**Rehmann Robson** **Troy, MI**
Key Personnel Hourly Rates	All personnel hourly rates listed as $225/hr	CHRO/Principal: $390/hr HR Director/Senior Manage: $225/hr HR Manager/Manager: $190/hr Senior HR Business Partner or Senior Analyst: $145/hr Staff: $120/hr Post Implementation On-Going Support, Blended Hours: $185/hr
References of comparable projects of similar scope & volume within last 5 years	West Bloomfield Twp Public Library, MI; City of Little Canada, MN; City of Pittsfield, MA; City of Troy, MI; City of Ferndale, MI; City of Coldwater & Coldwater Board of Public Utilities, MI; City of Sturgis, MI; DeWitt Charter Twp, MI; Bloomfield Twp Public Library, MI	City of Rochester Hills, MI; Grosse Ile Township, MI; Cascade Township, MI; Allegan County CMH Authority - OnPoint, MI; Little Traverse Bay Bands of Odawa Indians, MI; Integrated Services of Kalamazoo, MI; Wellvance/AuSable Valley CMHA, MI; Riverwood CMH, MI
Identify potential project challenges	Market survey participation; cost of implementing recommendations. Mitigation strategies have been provided.	Obtaining compatible documentation in timely manner; aggressive timeline for project completion; benefit structures have become increasingly more complex for public sector organizations; year end HR activities including open enrollment & 1/1/27 wage updates for RH & comparable organizations. Mitigation strategies provided.
Total Not-To-Exceed Cost	**$27,900.00**	**$176,584.00**
Exceptions	Clarifications regarding ownership of documents, indemnification, & subcontractor liability provided.	Clarification that their role is strictly advisory - final policy, budget authority, implementation is the responsibility of the City. FOIA expenses will be passed through to the City